



August 31, 2000

Mr. Eric Magee
Staff Attorney
Legal and Compliance Division
Texas Department of Insurance
P. O. Box 149104 MC 110-1A
Austin, Texas 78714-9104

OR2000-3387

Dear Mr. Magee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your requests were assigned ID# 138561 and 139732.

The Texas Department of Insurance (the "department") received two requests for the most recent private passenger automobile rate filings of Charter County Mutual Insurance Company ("Charter"). You assert no exception to the release of the information. However, you advise this office that the requested information may involve the proprietary or property interests of Charter.

Section 552.305(d) requires a governmental body to notify a third party whose interests may be at stake of the request for an attorney general decision. You state that you have notified Charter of the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in Public Information Act in certain circumstances).

Charter has not submitted to this office its reasons explaining why the requested information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude that the responsive information is excepted from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.110(b) (to prevent disclosure

of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual or evidentiary material, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that it actually faces competition and that substantial competitive injury would likely result from disclosure); Open Records Decision Nos. 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish prima facie case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990). Thus, the department must release the requested information to the requestors.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Patricia Michels Anderson", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Patricia Michels Anderson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PMA/pr

Ref: ID# 138561, 139732

Encl. Submitted documents

cc: Siobhan Vamosi
5225 Kaylin Drive
Akron, Ohio 44319
(w/o enclosures)

Lynda Ferguson, CPCU
Republic Insurance
P.O. Box 660302
Dallas, Texas 75266-0302

Jennifer Wareham
Compliance Coordinator
Charter County Mutual Insurance
P.O. Box 224046
Dallas, Texas 75222-4046